





The Center for the Study of Contemporary European Jewry The Lester and Sally Entin Faculty of Humanities Tel Aviv University With the support of The Adam and Gila Milstein Family Foundation The Irwin Cotler Institute Democracy I Human Rights | Justice The Lester and Sally Entin Faculty of Humanities Tel Aviv University With the support of Richard and Elaine Dubrovsky | Sara Vered

NC .



# WHO IS SPREADING LIES ON X?

In August 2017, the Israeli-German comedian and activist Shahak Shapira spray-painted tweets containing hate speech on the pavement in front of Twitter's European headquarters in Hamburg. Shapira had previously reported those tweets to Twitter because of their harmful content. The social media network, however, refused to delete them, citing its free speech policy.

The tweets Shapira painted on the street and sidewalk contained messages such as "Let's unite and gas some Jews again. Those were good times," "Another bunch of *Kanaken* [a German slur for people from the MENA region] arrived. Did they miss the exit to Auschwitz???," or "Niggers are a plague."<sup>1</sup>

Since social media networks emerged two decades ago, the spread of antisemitic, racist, misogynistic, homophobic, or otherwise hateful content on them has been a cause for concern.<sup>2</sup> Social media platforms opened new paths for spreading hate as users benefit from the (perceived) anonymity and, thus, the (perceived) immunity from legal repercussions.

One of the core problems in limiting hate speech on the internet is that there is no uniform international framework for doing so. Countries apply different social, political, and legal approaches to combat hate speech. For example, in essence, the United States (US) prioritizes free speech based on protections afforded in the First Amendment. The result is that hate speech is, to a large extent, permitted and a form of protected speech in the US. An example is the so-called "Auschwitz lie," according to which the Holocaust either did not happen or did not reach its mass-genocidal extent. On the other hand, based on the historical experience of the Holocaust, post-Second World War Germany enshrined as the first and most important clause in its constitution the protection of human dignity in Article 1. The goal was to stop future incitement against minorities. While free speech is also a constitutional right, enshrined in Article 5, para. 1, the constitution allows limiting speech under certain conditions, such as protecting human dignity. In Germany, denying the Holocaust is a crime punishable by prison.<sup>3</sup>

Sebastian Eder, "Ey Twitter, löscht den Scheiß," faz.net, August 7, 2017, https://www.faz.net/aktuell/gesellschaft/ menschen/twitter-hassbeitraege-vor-firmenzentrale-in-hamburg-gesprueht-15140487.html, and Julia Wadhawan and Noemi Mihalovici, "Twitter ignoriert Hasskommentare – Shahak Shapira sprüht sie ihnen vor die Haustür," spiegel.de, August 7, 2017, https://www.spiegel.de/panorama/hasstweets-shahak-shapira-bekennt-sich-zugraffities-vor-twitter-buero-in-hamburg-a-00000000-0003-0001-0000-000001576779.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> European Agency for Fundamental Rights, Online Content Moderation – Current Challenges in Detecting Hate Speech (Vienna/Luxemburg: Publications Office of the European Union: 2023); Zachary Laub, "Hate Speech on Social Media: Global Comparisons," Council on Foreign Relations, June 7, 2019, https://www.cfr. org/backgrounder/hate-speech-social-media-global-comparisons; The Economist, "In Germany, Online Hate Speech has Real-World Consequences," economist.com, January 12, 2018, https://www.economist.com/ graphic-detail/2018/01/12/in-germany-online-hate-speech-has-real-world-consequences; Philipp Bovermann and Tim Frehler, "Tanzt für uns," Süddeutsche Zeitung, February 6, 2024, https://www.sueddeutsche.de/ politik/afd-tiktok-rechtsextremismus-martin-sellner-erfolg.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Jamie Rauch, "The Good, the Bad, and the Historically Antisemitic: An Analytical Comparison of Anti-Hate Laws in Germany and the United States," *Brooklyn Journal of International Law* 47:1 (2021), 260-298.

In parallel to the development of online hate speech, scientific, political, and societal interest in the problem of online hate speech grew, and initiatives to address it proliferated, for example, in the form of legal frameworks and civil society organizations. Recently, the European Union (EU) established the Digital Services Act, which requires the largest social media platforms with millions of users to actively counter hate speech, and which, since early 2024, requires EU-member states to control those platforms.<sup>4</sup> Civil society initiatives such as HateAid, Klicksafe, and Stop Hate UK have led public awareness campaigns.

The largest social networks, such as Facebook, Instagram, and Twitter, have publicly announced that they would take measures to reduce the spread of hate speech.<sup>5</sup> The case of Twitter, renamed X in 2023 by its new owner, Elon Musk, stands out: it has become a favored platform for antisemites, racists, conspiracy theorists, and others who intend to spread hate online.<sup>6</sup>

This article seeks to contribute to the research on online hate speech in general and on the spread of antisemitic content on X in particular. Despite the existence of dozens of works on online hate speech, there is a shortage of information on the users spreading antisemitic content in various languages and the wider networks those users operate in. Recent reports suggest X has decided to take action against the proliferation of antisemitism on the platform. The article shows the essentiality of doing so.

# Methodology

When spending time on X, hate speech can be easily encountered randomly. To find and systematically analyze antisemitic content, one must first identify keywords commonly used to spread such content. For this study, keywords in English, German, and Arabic were chosen from lists of keywords identified in previous searches, studies, or trial runs as antisemitic.<sup>7</sup>

Each selected keyword clearly fell within the categories outlined by the International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance (IHRA) Working Definition of Antisemitism: "Antisemitism is a certain perception of Jews, which may be expressed as hatred toward Jews. Rhetorical and physical

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> European Commission, "The Commission Sends Request for Information to X under the Digital Services Act," ec.europa.eu, October 12, 2023, https://ec.europa.eu/commission/presscorner/detail/en/ip\_23\_4953.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> See, for example, Billy Perrigo, "Facebook Says It's Removing More Hate Speech Than Ever Before. But There's a Catch," Time, November 27, 2019, https://time.com/5739688/facebook-hate-speech-languages.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Sheera Frenkel and Kate Conge, "Quantifying A Large Rise In Hate Speech Under Musk," *New York Times*, December 3, 2022, Section B, 1.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> See, for example, Joe Mulhall, ed., Antisemitism in the Digital Age (London: HOPE not hate Charitable Trust, 2021); Martin J. Riedl, Katie Joseff, Stu Soorholtz, and Samuel Woolley, "Platformed Antisemitism on Twitter: Anti-Jewish Rhetoric in Political Discourse Surrounding the 2018 US Midterm Election," *new media & society* (2022), 1-21; ADL Center for Technology and Society, "Sliding Through: Spreading Antisemitism on TikTok by Exploiting Moderation Gaps," adl.org, November 20, 2023, https://www.adl.org/resources/blog/ sliding-through-spreading-antisemitism-tiktok-exploiting-moderation-gaps; Carl Miller, David Weir, Shaun Ring, Oliver Marsh, Chris Inskip, and Nestor Prieto Chavana, "Antisemitism on Twitter Before and After Elon Musk's Acquisition," CASM Technology and ISD, March 20, 2023, https://www.isdglobal.org/wp-content/ uploads/2023/03/Antisemitism-on-Twitter-Before-and-After-Elon-Musks-Acquisition.pdf.

manifestations of antisemitism are directed toward Jewish or non-Jewish individuals and/or their property, toward Jewish community institutions and religious facilities."<sup>8</sup>

The keywords chosen were "holohoax" and "Zionazis" in English, "Globalisten" in German, and "*Brutukalat Hukama' Sahayun*" (Protocols of the Elders of Zion) in Arabic.

Software identified that worldwide, 24,400 tweets used the keyword "holohoax" in the period August 13, 2022, to September 12, 2023. The software randomly selected 643 of those tweets and pulled all publicly open-source available data from the accounts that tweeted them. The selection included usernames, locations, gender, age, short bios, as well as the most common keywords and themes engaged with.<sup>9</sup>

All of the 643 collected tweets were read to check whether their content was antisemitic. The reading revealed that approximately 5% of tweets did not actually contain antisemitic messages but typically condemned the use of the antisemitic keyword. Sixty-four (64) tweets were randomly selected and qualitatively read and analyzed.

The same method was applied to the remaining keywords. The software identified that worldwide, 21,100 tweets contained the keyword "Zionazis," of which 1,308 were randomly selected and quantitatively analyzed for biographies, with 130 randomly selected and textually analyzed. Fifty-eight thousand four hundred (58,400) tweets contained the keyword "Globalisten," of which 2,151 were randomly selected and quantitatively analyzed for biographies; 215 were randomly selected and textually analyzed. Two-thousand nine hundred (2,900) tweets contained the keyword "Brutukalat," of which 1,433 were randomly selected and quantitatively analyzed for biographies; 140 were randomly selected and their content analyzed. For each sample, the qualitative reading revealed that 5% to 10% of tweets did not contain antisemitic messages.

A second round of data collection was conducted in early 2024 for tweets posted between October 7, 2023, and February 19, 2024, to compare and analyze the use of the selected keywords before and after the October 7 attack.

For this period, the software identified 25,800 tweets that contained the keyword holohoax, of which 2,730 were randomly selected and quantitatively analyzed for biographies. The software also identified 110,700 tweets containing the keyword Zionazis, of which 13,400 were randomly selected and quantitatively analyzed for biographies. The keyword Globalisten was found in 49,900 tweets, of which 7,380 were quantitatively analyzed. A further 3,100 tweets contained the keyword Brutukalat, of which 450 were quantitatively analyzed.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance: "Working Definition of Antisemitism," International Holocaust Remembrance Alliance, n.d., https://holocaustremembrance.com/resources/working-definition-antisemitism.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>9</sup> Users are free to choose their username and provide personal details about themselves. The content in no way has to match reality. For example, users can claim to live in London, while actually living in Paris; they can claim to be men, while actually being women; they can claim to be politicians, while actually being university professors; and they can claim to be called Max Mustermann, while actually being called Jane Doe.

# Analysis and Results

# Holohoax

# Locations

Users spreading the keyword holohoax mainly claimed to be in English-speaking countries. Before October 7, 2023, almost 85% claimed to be in the United States, 3% claimed to be in Canada, and just under 3% claimed to be in the United Kingdom (UK). The remaining users came from other locations.

This means that US users were strongly overrepresented: the keyword holohoax was more than 30 times more popular in the US than in the UK, despite the US having only around four times as many Twitter/X users as the UK (95.4 million to 23.2 million, respectively).<sup>10</sup>

Following the October 7 attacks, the share of users from the United States and the UK that tweeted about an alleged holohoax slightly increased (84.8% to 86.5% and 2.7% to 3.4%, respectively), while the share of users from Canada decreased (3.0% to 2.8%).

#### Gender

A majority of approximately 56% of users before October 7 and 60% of users following October 7 that shared the holohoax keyword on Twitter/X were male. The findings befit the general statistics about gender distribution and X use, according to which, for example, around 63% of users in the US are male and 37% are female.<sup>11</sup>

# Age

Around 70% of users spreading the holohoax keyword on X, before and after October 7, were up to 34 years old. This means that users spreading the keyword holohoax were far younger than the average X user. Worldwide, only 56% of users fall into the 18-24 years and 25-34 years age ranges.<sup>12</sup> The findings further show that the October 7 attacks had a minor impact on the age distribution.

Statista, "Leading Countries Based on Number of X (formerly Twitter) Users as of January 2023," Statista, January 2023, https://www.statista.com/statistics/242606/number-of-active-twitter-users-in-selected-countries/, and Jack Shepherd, "23 Essential Twitter (X) Statistics You Need to Know in 2024," Social Shepherd, January 5, 2024, https://thesocialshepherd.com/blog/twitter-statistics.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Stacy Jo Dixon, "Distribution of Twitter Users in the United States as of January 2023, by Gender," Statista, March 1, 2023, https://www.statista.com/statistics/678794/united-states-twitter-gender-distribution/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Stacy Jo Dixon, "Distribution of Twitter users worldwide as of April 2021, by age group," Statista, March 29, 2022, https://www.statista.com/statistics/283119/age-distribution-of-global-twitter-users/; Brooke Auxier and Monica Anderson, "Social Media Use in 2021," Pew Research Center, April 7, 2021, https://www.pewresearch.org/internet/2021/04/07/social-media-use-in-2021/; Frederik Harms, "Anteil der Nutzer von Social-Media-Plattformen nach Altersgruppen in Deutschland im Jahr 2023," Statista, January 29, 2024, https://de.statista.com/statistik/daten/studie/543605/umfrage/verteilung-der-nutzer-von-social-media-plattformen-nach-altersgruppen-in-deutschland/.

#### **Content of Tweets and Bios**

Users referring to a holohoax showcase strong sympathy for contemporary right-wing US politics: They echo calls for white supremacy, voice support for Donald Trump, and object to gun control and abortion. Among users analyzed for this study, the ones sharing the holohoax keyword were the most outspoken and unambiguous about their hatred for Jews and other minorities.

The analyzed tweets and bios contained a narrow spectrum of themes and topics, most prominently spreading nationalist and white supremacist ideology, denying the Holocaust, and promoting hatred for and violence against Jews. There was evidence for the belief in broader antisemitic conspiracy theories, such as about secret Jewish world domination.

The keywords most repeated in tweets by some users who referred to a holohoax included PaulGosar, killthejews, TheNoticing, BanTheADL, and BIRTHCERTIFICATEFRAUD.<sup>13</sup> Some of those keywords speak for themselves, such as "killthejews" or "BanTheADL."

Others require readers to be familiar with right-wing discourses. Paul Gosar, for example, is a US Congressman from Arizona. Gosar supported the false claim that the 2020 elections were rigged. Gosar echoes political discourses, including sharing links to websites praising Hitler and denying the Holocaust.<sup>14</sup> TheNoticing refers to people who believe they can see the truth, unlike most others, and notice or become aware of Jewish conspiracies for world domination. TheNoticing is also the name of an antisemitic Telegram channel.

The users' bios revealed a similar pattern. Among the most repeated keywords were "white," "right," "truth," "noticer," "proud," and "Jew." The most prominent theme in the bios was (white) nationalism, including support for white supremacy. Users were outspoken about their hatred for Jews as well as for other minorities. For example, users called themselves "supporters of white people, their culture and their history," "pro-white," or "PROUD WHITE MALE!"<sup>15</sup>

One user described himself as a "Red Blooded American. Patriot. Veteran. Gun Owner. Far Right Extremist. Deplorable. Ethnocentric & Proud of my European Heritage." Another was a "DEFENDER OF WESTERN CIVILISATION!" who added that "WHITE WELLBEING IS NON-NEGOTIABLE!!!!" Other users promoted slogans such as "America First" or proclaimed support for the (former) Confederacy.

- <sup>13</sup> The keywords DemVoice1 and VoteBlueEveryElection are prominent. A detailed reading of the tweets containing the keywords revealed that the users criticized Antisemitic hate speech, such as "holohoax." See, for example, the tweet, "The GOP are showing us who they are, and we should believe them. Hey Arizonal!! You choose to send Gosar to Congress. Does his behavior reflect your values? I hope not! #VoteBlueEveryElection #DemVoice1 #FreshResists QT @ProjectLincoln: .@RepGosar yesterday used his https://t.co/dzchA8jp8l newsletter to promote a site that has posted content calling the Holocaust "the Holohoax" and telling readers to "stand up for Hitler." The GOP isn't hiding who they truly are anymore" (http://twitter.com/Mad\_as\_hell/ status/1684334723613724673).
- <sup>14</sup> Jerod Macdonald-Evoy, "Paul Gosar Promoted an Antisemitic Website that Praised him for Condemning 'Jewish Warmongers," *Arizona Mirror*, April 17, 2023, https://azmirror.com/2023/04/17/paul-gosar-promotedan-antisemitic-website-that-praised-him-for-condemning-jewish-warmongers/.
- <sup>15</sup> Here, as in the following, quotes are not adjusted for caps lock, nor are typographical or grammatical errors corrected.

The second prominent theme after promoting nationalism was openly displayed antisemitism (when it was not already included in claims for white Christian exclusivity). For example, one user referred to himself as "PURE BLOOD ANTI JEW." Another stated that "as my dear friend Ezra Pound once said, 'There is a reason they have been banished from 109 nations.'" Another wrote that "goyimlivesmatter" and yet another referred to himself as a "(((noticer)))."

Another wrote that the "jew world order is white genocide." Yet another wrote that he was "Unapologetically white. Counter-semite. Segregationist." Other users who professed allegiance to American extremist Nick Fuentes used the abbreviation NatSoc (National Socialist) in their bios or stated that "Weimar problems demand Weimar solutions."

Antisemitism was also expressed through belief in conspiracy theories. The belief in secret Jewish control of the world's financial and economic systems plays a central role in the far-right worldview. Users employing the keyword holohoax confirm this. They stated in their bios that they opposed the "New World Order," the World Economic Forum (WEF), the Rothschilds, the Rockefellers, the Wallenbergs, Blackrock, and Vanguard. One wrote that he was against "all the satanic elite globalists with their sick pedophile cult and Agenda 2030."

The Agenda 2030 for Sustainable Development is a United Nations plan of 17 development goals, including reducing poverty and hunger and improving education for all. In the eyes of some conspiracy theorists, it is a plan to shift control of the "world order" to a secretive elite made up mainly of Jews. As will be discussed more in-depth below under the keyword Globalisten, some users prided themselves on their alleged ability to think independently and, unlike most people, see the truth behind the global power game.

Other conspiracy theories promoted by users included the myth that the COVID-19 pandemic either did not exist, that it existed but was planned by the government to subdue the population, or that the vaccinations developed against COVID-19 were actually injections used to control humans by secretly implanting a microchip in them. One user, for example, spoke of the "Plandemic." Other users supported the idea that the Earth is flat.

Some users showed overwhelming support for former President Trump. This prompted users to proudly claim that they participated in the January 6, 2021, Capitol attack or at least supported it. They promoted the lie that the 2020 US elections were rigged or called for an uprising against the government by declaring, "This is the time we have been preparing for our entire lives. The time to expose and eradicate evil."

In line with the political views promoted by Trump and the vast majority of Republicans, users employing the keyword holohoax rejected gun control (some even compared it to slavery), proclaimed their Christian faith (including posting Bible verses in their bios), and voiced opposition to sexual and gender diversity.

Some examples of tweets and user bios from the holohoax realm follow:

# Tweets

- 1. holohoax included. oy vey not the 6 gorillion!!
- 2. Nah, the holohoax has been going for about 50 years and shows little sign of slowing any time soon.
- 3. It's not just the ADL [Anti-Defamation League]. It's all jews pretty much, they don't hide it at all. Just look up all the anti-white articles and see who wrote them. Then, watch videos of rabbis speaking of the white race. Stuff is so obvious, and people are blinded by chosen and holohoax
- 4. She's not white, she's a jew her family were survivors of the holohoax apparently, surprise surprise. Why have they been the eternal victims since the middle ages? Or have they? What is Semitism?
- 5. 6 gorillian were gassed at lampshade soap factories just so gubment [government] employees could ride dune buggies on the moon. forget that there were only 3 to 4 million jays in German occupied Europe and 3 to 4 million holohoax survivors it's still mankind's greatness achievement in Eurolib
- 6. According to jews (deserved lower case j!), everything others do/say is anti-Semitic. Does it surprise me that the biggest liars/thieves, most evil ppl, turn out to b the biggest whiners/ bitches? Nah, not at all. Due to a false holohoax death toll, y'all were given a great....
- 7. Oh yeah a 6 million def got gassed in the #holohoax if I didn't say that already. That's why jews were so grateful that the goyish Americans saved them from the gas chambers.. that's why they took over the media to blame whitey for every little thing that ever happened
- 8. Now do yiz believe us? #nazi #holohoax #thirdreichadvocate
- 9. Anti\_Semitism. Your lot took out the hyphen, but we put it back. Semitism= gays, porn, media lies, 911 lies, holohoax nonsense and other Jew evil. We know, we are sick of your kvetching [complaining]. We talk about Semitism now, recognise it for what it is.
- 10. Blacks use slavery for an excuse to riot and attack people Jews use the holohoax for money and deflection from their own evil agenda

# Bio

- 1. A HERO FOR ALL OF US -- Supporter of White People, their Culture, & History. The USA is part Confederacy we have states. Understand that & be tolerant.
- 2. Volk | heathen | lover of fine arts and reading dusty books | Pro-White, Nationalist and traditionalist | Fren | Antiwhites will be mocked then blocked
- 3. (((noticer))) posting memes & debating things that usually get me suspended // GoyimLivesMatter // Opinions change as I learn // Gab: TalmudDisrespecter o/

Following the October 7 attacks, keywords and themes referring to the Israeli-Palestinian conflict entered tweets that contained the keyword holohoax. The conflict became such a prominent

issue that it dominated the X debate surrounding a holohoax. Apart from the conflict, tweets referred to contemporary political debates, such as the MiLeg (Michigan Legislature) or the 2024 presidential elections.

# Zionazis

# Locations

Users spreading the keyword Zionazis mainly claimed to be in English-speaking countries, even though the term itself is not necessarily English. The wordplay would work, for example, in German or French. Before October 7, almost 55% of users spreading the term Zionazis came from the United States, trailed by the United Kingdom, where some 6% of users joined the debate.

Significant, albeit smaller, shares of users were from India, Mexico, the Palestinian territories, and Australia. A potential reason for this was that the term aims more at the ongoing Israeli-Palestinian conflict, as it specifically targets Zionism, which is more acceptable than using a term that denies the Holocaust.

Following the October 7 attacks, the share of users from the United States grew (54.7% to 71.3%), indicating the prominence of the term among users debating the events on and following October 7. Similarly, the share of users from the United Kingdom grew (6.2% to 8.1%), indicating an overall dominance of the term Zionazis in English tweets.

As the keyword is not clearly affiliated with a language, it is difficult to say whether users from some countries are over or underrepresented. However, the dominance of users from the United States – making up more than half of all users for a keyword that can be used in different languages – is striking. It befits the overrepresentation of US users who use the term holohoax.

# Gender

As with the term holohoax, the gender distribution of users spreading the term Zionazis was clearly in favor of male users. Notably, the share decreased following the October 7 attacks, indicating that more female Twitter/X users joined in the debate and spread the term Zionazis. This was not the case with the term holohoax and neither, as will be shown below, with Globalisten. However, it was similar to the development of the term Brutukalat.

# Age

Similar to the term holohoax, the age distribution for users sharing the keyword Zionazis on X was younger than the age distribution of all X users. The distribution did not change drastically following October 7, the share of users in the age group 25-34 grew by 4%, while the share of those in the age group 18-24 decreased by around the same percentage.

# **Content of Tweets and Bios**

Even before the events of October 7, users spreading the keyword Zionazis had two clearly defined political interests: the Israeli-Palestinian conflict, in which they uniquely sided with

the latter, and contemporary US political issues, particularly those popular among left-leaning civil rights movements.

All keywords mentioned by spreaders of the keyword Zionazis refer to the conflict. There are almost no calls for violence against Jews (though the use of the term Zionazis itself is obscene and violent); there are no pledges of allegiance to right-wing politicians; and there are no references to political issues such as gun control, abortion, or migration. Some users distinguish between Zionists and Jews.

Some users criticize politicians, including Donald Trump, Joe Biden or Sadiq Khan for their support for Israel. Some allege that politicians have been bought by Zionists. Such allegations mirror prominent conspiracy theories about Jewish control of media, government, and finance. Other users refer to the Holocaust, which they do not deny, as a comparison to the current situation in the Palestinian territories.

Keyword	Mentions
FreePalestine	1182
IsraeliCrimes	980
Jenin	832

The analysis of users' profile bios confirms their main interest lies in the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. They either identified as being of Palestinian origin or as supporters of the Palestinian cause. Some users also referenced other contemporary political issues, mainly on the left of the US political spectrum.

Along with freepalestine and Palestine, popular keywords were also BLM [Black Lives Matter], defund the police, freecollege, or m4all [medicines for all]. Support for the Black Lives Matter movement and the idea of defunding the police are situated on the left of the American political spectrum. Other users declared dissatisfaction with party politics and shunned Democrats and Republicans. UK users voiced support for Labour politician Jeremy Corbyn, an outspoken supporter of the Palestinian cause.

Several keywords appeared in the bios exactly the same number of times. This makes it likely that the profiles are either automated accounts, so-called bots, or orchestrated accounts run professionally by real users rather than mere expressions of individual political opinions.

Some examples of tweets and bios using the Zionazis keyword follow:

# Tweets

- 1. @Navi\_Nistar @muhammadshehad2 Zionazi mentality...always feeling entitled to steal whatever land they want....squatters DNA goes through generations in zionazis
- 2. @DumisaniTemsgen #Palestinian rockets are #Muslim rockets. They terrorise & kill Jewish women & children. #Zionist #moral bombs & death squads neutralise #Palestinian #terrorist women & children. #ZioNazis are delusional. They're an obstacle to peaceful living & human progress.

- 3. @Ostrov\_A @FoxNews @grossmanhannah Zionazis are scared when they are criticized and exposed for #IsraeliCrimes, the Zionazi cult is not owned by Jews and the Jewish community condemns #israelicrimes and considers them disgraceful to entire humanity.
- 4. @redbridgelabour Why do Redbridge support Zionazis that Holocaust survivors and Jewish academics have denounced? https://t.co/hhWTJA4kkv
- 5. #UN and #ICC <sup>4</sup>/<sub>4</sub>MUST know the #ZioNazis <sup>conc</sup>tinue their #WarCriminal <sup>6</sup>/<sub>9</sub>#EthnicCleansing <sup>5</sup>/<sub>9</sub> of #Palestine <sup>conc</sup>WHAT are they going to do about it? #FreePalestineNOW!! <sup>5</sup>/<sub>9</sub> <sup>conc</sup> <sup>4</sup>/<sub>4</sub> <sup>4</sup>/
- 6. @V\_Palestine20 Cute. Hope they enjoy their time in Palestine before they get deported once again. Destroy the ZioNazis. Their clock is ticking. https://t.co/b7XTeoPO5N
- 7. Here is Keir Starmer heaping praise on the British Muslim Heritage Centre, with Maqsood "Zionazis!" Ahmad. "Fantastic", "wisdom", "inspiring", an "interfaith example". Afzal Khan MP is a keen patron of the Centre. Anything to say, Labour? https://t.co/lacG4kr0Sk
- 8. Fake Jews from Eastern Europe are calling us antisemites, but real Jews don't agree and are calling them zionazis!
- 9. @israel\_advocacy @hrw @KhuloodBadawi Did Muhammad Khdeir have a weapon, did Ali Dawabshe have a weapon, did the children playing soccer on Gaza's beach have weapons. Did she have a weapon ?? Did they have weapons ?, NO NO NO. Zionazis murder Pal children. Stop playing the victim. https://t.co/snIBvqy2yU
- 10. @mishtal A day in life of a Nazi Calling him/herself a Zionist Deciding what bs they are going to spread with other Zionazis Crying wolf when challenged Claiming Jews are Zionists Foaming at the mouth when their fake narrative is destroyed Begging US for aid

#### Bios

- 1. #FreePalestine #EndApartheid #BLM #ErinGoBraugh #M4All #GND #FreeCollege #LivingWage #PaidSickLeave #DefundThePolice #DefundThePentagon
- 2. Learning, Sharing, 🖾, I block Zionist trolls.
- 3. Views are my own. Zionism is not Judaism it is anti-Semitic UAE & Saudi doesn't represent all Muslims and Arabs

Following the October 7 attacks, users who were posting the keyword Zionazis, kept their focus on the Israeli-Palestinian conflict. Keywords referring to other contemporary political issues, in the US or other countries, played no role, though the names of leading politicians are referred to in connection to the conflict. Examples include: GenocideJoe, POTUS\_too\_is\_a\_ War\_Criminal, Bundeskanzler, RishiSunak, or VonDerLeyenWarCriminalAccomplice. Except for the reference to President Biden, those terms did not make the list of top-10 keywords, but followed shortly after that.

# Globalisten

The German term Globalisten does not directly derive from globalization but from globalism (*Globalismus*). Globalization denotes the advancing of global interconnectivity, for example, of peoples and cultures or markets and supply chains. Globalism is a conspiracy theory, spread mainly by right-wing extremists, claiming that there are agents behind globalization who seek to erect a new, globalist order by purposefully destroying naturally developed national, political, and cultural identities.<sup>16</sup>

For example, those who advance this conspiracy theory believe that Globalisten initiate and guide large-scale migration movements to destroy homogenous nation-states and replace ethnically distinct peoples with a uniform being (*Einheitsmensch*).

For people who believe this, the group of Globalisten is made up of Jews who orchestrate the global restructuring as well as their puppets. Synonyms for Globalisten are the "East Coast" (Nazi slur for New York City, which Nazis presented as the center of a Jewish-controlled world capitalism) and the "Zionist Occupied Government" (implying that Western governments, mainly of the United States, cave to Zionist interests. White supremacist extremists believe that the United States is an ethnically heterogeneous state, a society of immigrants, that has never had a pure ethnic identity and that thus easily fell prey to Jewish plans for world domination).<sup>17</sup>

The German Domestic Intelligence Service (*Verfassungsschutz*), the agency responsible for, among other tasks, detecting and tracking antisemitic tendencies, explains that in the German-speaking context, antisemitic codes replace overt antisemitic messages. Among the codes for antisemitic conspiracies, the agency cites Globalisten, Ostküste (East Coast), or Neue Weltordnung (New World Order).<sup>18</sup> The reason is that German-speaking users are typically more careful when expressing antisemitism than users who speak other languages.

#### Locations

Users spreading antisemitic content by referring to the keyword Globalisten, mainly claimed to be in German-speaking countries. Already before October 7, 2023, over 80% of users were from Germany, around 5% from Austria, and around 3% from Switzerland.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Mark Weitzman, "Globalization, Conspiracy Theory, and the Shoah," in Robert S. Wistrich, ed., *Holocaust Denial – The Politics of Perfidy* (Berlin: De Gruyter 2012), 197-200.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Felix Neumann, "Was verstehen Rechtsextremisten unter Globalismus?," kas.de, n.d., https://www.kas.de/de/ web/extremismus/rechtsextremismus/was-verstehen-rechtsextremisten-unter-globalismus; Antonio Amadeu Stiftung, "Gruppen, denen eine Beteiligung an der 'Weltverschwörung' vorgeworfen wird," Antonio Amadeu Stiftung, n.d., https://www.amadeu-antonio-stiftung.de/verschwoerungsmythen-und-antisemitismus/ begriffe-trends-und-dauerbrenner-der-verschwoerungsideologien. See also Matthias Meisner, "Juden als Feigenblatt," Jüdische Allgemeine, February 22, 2024, https://www.juedische-allgemeine.de/politik/judenals-feigenblatt/.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> Bundesamt für Verfassungsschutz, Lagebild Antisemitismus 2020/21 (Cologne: Bundesamt für Verfassungsschutz 2022); see also Sascha Lobo's ridiculization of those dressing their antisemitism in coded language in order to cover it: "Antisemitismus erkennen für Anfänger," Der Spiegel, February 1, 2024, https://www.spiegel.de/ netzwelt/antisemitismus-erkennen-fuer-anfaenger-wie-man-hass-gegen-juden-enttarnt-a-7752e35c-52df-4646-9222-bfcd206040ed.

The distribution, compared to population sizes and prominence of Twitter/X in various countries, shows a slight misrepresentation: X is most popular in Switzerland, where 17% of people aged 18-64 claim to use it, followed by Germany (16%) and Austria (13%).<sup>19</sup> Germany has a population of 83.2 million, Austria 9 million, and Switzerland 8.7 million. Thus, Swiss users are slightly underrepresented while German and especially Austrian users are overrepresented in the use of the term Globalisten compared to average X users.

Following the October 7 attacks, the global share in using the term Globalisten roughly remained the same in Switzerland and Austria, while it grew in Germany from 82.4% to 87.6%.

#### Gender

The keyword Globalisten was more popular among male users than among female users (66.1% to 33.9%). The October 7 events hardly impacted the gender distribution (66.0% to 34.0%).

#### Age

The age distribution mirrors findings from above regarding the use of the terms holohoax and Zionazis. Users were on average younger than average Twitter/X users. Unlike the previous keywords, for which the age distribution slightly shifted in favor of younger users following October 7, the events hardly impacted the age distribution among German-speaking users who tweeted about Globalisten. This indicates that the escalation of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict did not significantly affect the political interests of users philosophizing about globalism. It did not motivate users who had not previously engaged with the term Globalisten to join in the debate.

#### **Content of Tweets and Bios**

The analysis of tweets containing the term Globalisten showed that users were less straightforward about their hatred for Jews than users who wrote about a holohoax. They were, on the other hand, more straightforward about their hatred for other minorities and particularly for migrants. Apart from that, they were outspoken about their support for right-wing politics, mainly for the far-right alternative für Deutschland (AfD).<sup>20</sup> Among users referring to Globalisten, the propensity to believe in and repeat conspiracy theories was evident.

The ambiguity about hatred for Jews, especially compared to the term holohoax, is most likely the result of greater policing and surveillance by security services. For the same reason, German-speaking users tend to label their accounts as satire, pretending that the conspiracy theories and hate speech they spread are just jokes. As indicated in the introduction, legal consequences for hate speech, slander, and Holocaust denial are greater in Germany than in some other countries.

- <sup>19</sup> Mathias Brandt, "Twitter im DACH-Raum vergleichsweise unpopulär," Statista, November 14, 2022, https:// de.statista.com/infografik/26062/umfrage-zur-regelmaessigen-twitter-nutzung-in-ausgewaehlten-laendern/.
- <sup>20</sup> Deutsche Welle, "Germany: AfD Youth Group can be Classified as 'Extremist,'" *Deutsche Welle*, February 6, 2024, https://www.dw.com/en/germany-afd-youth-group-can-be-classified-as-extremist/a-68186617; Ann-Katrin Müller, "The German AfD's Constant Drift Toward Extremism," *Der Spiegel*, August 4, 2023, https://www.spiegel.de/international/germany/rising-right-the-german-afd-s-constant-drift-toward-extremism-a-4b88b469-e790-47e9-871d-f8f208dd58ba?sara\_ref=re-xx-cp-sh.

Similar to users tweeting about holohoax, users referring to Globalisten showed a strong affinity for extremist ideology. The latter were more outspoken than the former about their belief in a broader range of conspiracy theories. Antisemitism also played a central role, however, in the form of coded language. Holocaust denial is almost nonexistent in German-speaking tweets, unlike in those from the holohoax realm.

The most popular keywords in German-speaking tweets revolved around two themes: the spread of conspiracy theories, sometimes involving global organizations, and the rejection of the current political leadership tied to the claimed support of the far-right AfD.

Among the most popular keywords are some that speak for themselves, such as WEF, Davos, or WHO (World Health Organization), which are tied to alleged conspiracies by a secretive elite and the global institutions they allegedly dominate. In the eyes of basically all believers in those conspiracies, Jews play a central role.

To understand other keywords requires some familiarity with contemporary conspiracy theories. Among those theories, the Great Reset is currently the most popular, as it links to several others. Great Reset is the term used for the belief that a secretive global elite (that is at least partly Jewish) is currently working to rearrange or "reset" the global political, financial, and social order. The theory stretches to migration being used to destroy ethnically homogeneous peoples.

Other keywords require some familiarity with current political debates in Germany. GrueneFilz, for example, refers to an affair in which a high-ranking Secretary of State (in Germany, the rank under the minister) belonging to the Green Party, installed his best man as the head of a federal agency. As a consequence, the state secretary stepped down and his best man did not assume his role as leader of the agency.<sup>21</sup>

The bios of German-speaking users confirm the pattern. They too hint at two major themes. The belief in conspiracy theories and the engagement with contemporary political issues. The most popular keyword in those bios is freedom, appearing in German and English. Users believe that their freedom is undermined by the abovementioned actors who seek to establish a new system.

German-speaking users expanded on their political affiliations in their profile bios. They did so in abstract terms by claiming they were "liberal-conservative" or "conservative-right." They defined themselves in opposition to "Red-Green ideology and opportunism [the colors of the Social Democrats and the Green Party respectively; both are currently part of the governing coalition]," "Gendernonsens," "climate fascism," and migration politics. Others were "anti-woke," "anti-vegan," or "genuinely" educated and thus not compatible with the "Green-Left." One user opposed Germany's alleged "neo-socialist, eco-fascist transformation," another claimed that a "pandemic coup" had occurred in Germany, calling the government a "dictatorship," or a "*Scheindemokratie*" (sham democracy).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> Associated Press, "Top German Ministry Official Resigns after Accusations of Favoritism," Associated Press, May 17, 2023, https://apnews.com/article/germany-government-graichen-favoritismd875e3910c0b7ac43a1c7644e3bb385e.

Several users positively identified with political parties. Those included primarily the rightwing, or even far-right AfD and a party called Die Basis. The latter was founded during the COVID-19 Pandemic by people who opposed government measures to curb the virus' spread and felt that the government was unjustly limiting legal freedoms. Its political outlook and propensity to spread conspiracy theories match the AfD's. Other users professed allegiance to the Christian Democrats (CDU and CSU).

Befitting the claimed political affiliations, users spreading antisemitic messages using the term Globalisten promoted the idea of a world organized according to ethno-nationalist states. The idea has for some time been a pillar of right-wing political thought. Each ethnically rooted nation should live with full autonomy in its (historic or mythical) homeland. As such, states can cooperate economically while political cooperation remains limited.

Migration and the mixing of ethnicities and cultures are rejected. Users promoted a "Europe of Nations," a "national pacifist" Germany, "a World of free people[s]," or "Germany first." They insisted on a German right to identity, culture, *Heimat*, and future, as well as "white survival." Users emphasized their opposition to immigration, *Überfremdung* [exaggerated alienation of the domestic population], and Islamization. Instead, they advocated for remigration [a term used by the far-right to denote the forced migration of people with migration backgrounds, including those with German citizenship].

A common theme among users who tweeted under the keyword Globalisten was skepticism of the media. Journalists were suspected of not telling the truth and instead being "in" on a government conspiracy. One user promoted "independent and unideological journalism." Others promoted alternative media outlets affiliated with the far-right, such as "Achse des Guten [Axis of Good; a reference to the Axis of Evil]."

In the same vein, users expressed distrust in global elites and organizations, calling, for example, for the arrest of Bill Gates (according to COVID-19-related conspiracies, Gates – whom some conspiracy theorists hold to be Jewish and in cahoots with George Soros – planned to implant microchips into human bodies in order to control them). Users presented a list of organizations they rejected. The EU, the WHO, the WEF, and the US Federal Reserve Bank are among them. One user called to "protect the children from high finance" – a code for Jews.

Based on the expressed distrust in media and international organizations, users implored fellow Twitter/X users to return to being self-determined and self-thinking individuals and to no longer be sheep who obey the corrupt system. Users were proud to state that they, unlike others, were the really free people able to withstand government control, that they were able to see truths hidden from others, that they critically questioned information provided to them, that they were able to think for themselves, and that they were truth seekers.

The self-proclaimed free thinkers had a different perspective on contemporary world events than what they considered the mainstream. A core notion for them was "peace." Users claimed they promoted peace, unlike the mainstream, which was intent on war and destruction. For users, this meant that the West should stop supporting Ukraine in its defense against the Russian invasion. Some users claimed that NATO was attacking Putin and Russia.

Instead, they promoted friendship with Russia. Users were united in a belief that there were deeper reasons for the "alleged" war and that it was orchestrated by mysterious powers to serve their interests. One user, for example, claimed that "the established parties [i.e. mainstream German parties] lead Germany into World War 3 against Russia."

In the same vein, users cited common conspiracy theories according to which airplanes secretly spread chemical agents (known as chemtrails), modern 5G communication technologies spread cancer, and COVID-19 vaccinations were used to implant genes or microchips into human bodies. Several users proudly proclaimed that they were "unvaccinated and untested [against/for COVID-19]." One called the government and health care system "Covid terrorists."

Users also linked distrust in health care and vaccinations with an interest in alternative lifestyles. They were interested in Demeter foods (a form of biodynamic agriculture) and Waldorf (also known as Steiner) education. Several users objected to digitalization.

Some examples of tweets and bios from the Globalisten realm follow:

#### Tweets

- 1. Inclusion [here: integrating handicapped children into regular schools] slows down healthy children and is a farce. Inclusion is a further project by the Globalists to harm Germany. Handicapped people ARE a burden to society. Obviously.
- 2. The Globalists, Rotschild & Co
- 3. Yes, the dishonest Oldparties [established German political parties] work for the WEF and for the Globalists....we should stand on the side of the people's party AfD.
- 4. News from the Globalists: "financial shock" and climate control to initiate their Great Reset [conspiracy theory according to which the Covid19-pandemic was a hoax used to create a so-called new world order and seize political and economic control].
- 5. The Muslims are not the primary problem. They are just tools of the Globalists. Yes, we will have to come to terms [with them]. The goose is cooked [*die Messe ist wohl gelesen*]. But that does not mean that the way we will live together is already set in stone.
- 6. Ukraine War, BRICS-currency, Putin all a lie? We are being lied to & betrayed that's clear, but is everything really planned? Is Putin a cheat on the side of the Rothschild-Globalists? Is Putin cheating?
- 7. The debate has made the WEF-Globalist-Homo-Resetters very afraid of an uprising by the German people, so that they had to initiate this false-flag operation.
- 8. Total realignment and kick out all the corrupt Globalists and bucklers. Then we could talk. Until then #onlyAfD
- 9. The basis of the calculated mass-immigration to Germany is by the way the destruction of the ethnic identity and the belief in the calculated design of human DNA through breeding and manipulation. The Globalists are fascist-communists and at the same time transhumans and eugenics. They believe that they can create a worldwide homogenous race

through calculated mass-immigration. Ethnically homogenous islands like the German one will make way for a global, coffee-brown mixed race. That is not my opinion but that of the Globalists...in order to anticipate the accusation of racism.

10. Who is responsible for Germany's downfall? The voters? Russia? No, it is due to the ideology of Eco-Socialists and the interests of Globalists. The discussion here of firewalls is an absolute joke [the term firewall – Brandmauer – is used in German discourse to speak of a protection of the democratic discourse from right-wing extremists]!

#### Bios

- 1. Swimming against the current is a sport too. Freedom 🗽 liberal-conservative, post-graduate studies, against state patronizing, critical questioning!
- 2. Dealing with animals, professionally and privately. Politically conservative / right. Unvaccinated. Against Red-Green ideology and opportunism. I am here for a normal G.
- 3. 888 author satire channel living human being who thinks for himself maximum oh medium or what? Climate lie = distraction from chemtrails Haarp 5G gene injections.

The content of tweets about Globalisten was almost not affected by the intensification of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict after October 7. The ten most prominent keywords almost uniquely focused on German political issues. The keywords indicate support for the AfD. Neuwahlen and Ampelbeenden are calls for the government to resign. Only the keywords Hamas and Israel point to the conflict.

# Brutukalat

#### Locations

Users spreading antisemitic content through messages containing the keyword Brutukalat (Protocols) mainly claimed to be in Arabic-speaking countries. Both before and after October 7, around half of all users came from Saudi Arabia (47.4% before and 54.3% after), with significant shares of users stemming from Morocco (14.1% before and 24.6% after) and Egypt (6.1% before and 8.5% after).

X is roughly 2.7 times more in use in Saudi Arabia (15.5 million users) than in Egypt (5.8 million users).<sup>22</sup> However, the share of users from Saudi Arabia who tweet about Brutukalat was seven to eight times higher than in Egypt.

Potential explanations for the misrepresentation may be found in the size and structure of diaspora Palestinian populations in Arab countries, representations of Jews in the education system, the existence of peace treaties with Israel and general attitudes toward the Israeli-Palestinian conflict.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Statista, "Leading countries based on number of X (formerly Twitter) users as of January 2023."

#### Gender

The share of male users spreading the keyword Brutukalat was far higher than that of female users (76.0% to 24.0%). Following the October 7 attacks, more women began referring to Brutukalat and thus joined the debate (from 24.0% before to 28.0% after).

#### Age

As with the other keywords investigated for this study, users spreading the term Brutukalat were, on average, younger than overall X users. As with the term Zionazis, the share of younger users further increased following October 7, indicating that the escalation of the Israeli-Palestinian conflict motivated more younger users to join the debate.

#### **Content of Tweets and User Bios**

Arabic-speaking users who tweeted about the Protocols were mainly interested in how so-called Jewish conspiracies affected the Arab and Muslim worlds. Some users included a reference to religious salvation in their tweets.

Similar to users who tweeted about Globalisten, some users referred to popular contemporary conspiracy theories, for example, about Freemasons, the COVID-19 pandemic, vaccination campaigns, global poverty issues, and chemtrails. These topics were then intertwined with the Protocols in discussions, typically framing them to suggest a grand, cohesive plot influencing various global events.

The most popular keywords among Arabic-speaking users allowed much less insight into their worldview than for English and German-speaking users. Keywords were either generic, such as book – a reference to the Protocols – or were signs of religious affirmations to Allah and the Prophet Muhammad – as are common in Arabic discourses.

Arabic-speaking users who tweeted about the Protocols connected the historical document with various other conspiracy theories, merging historical prejudices with contemporary global and local concerns. This combination of conspiracy theories with the Protocols emphasizes the enduring role of the document as a framework for interpreting global, regional, and domestic events and processes. As with the other investigated keywords, around 10% of tweets went against the majority opinion on Twitter/X. In that case, this meant that users acknowledged the Protocols were a forgery, with some arguing that the document was crafted as antisemitic propaganda.

A predominant narrative in the tweets revolved around the interpretation of the Protocols as a comprehensive blueprint devised by Jews with the objective of global domination. It paints a comprehensive picture of a supposed clandestine effort to reshape the world order in accordance with the Protocols in order to subjugate the entire human population, obliterate all (or most) non-Jewish peoples, and fulfill Jewish prophecies regarding the End of Days.

Users showcased a belief that the unfolding of significant historical events over the last century directly corresponds with the schemes outlined in the Protocols. Notable global occurrences such as the Bolshevik Revolution and the two World Wars were cited as manifestations of

this grand strategy. Furthermore, proponents of this theme asserted that Jewish influence pervaded all major global institutions, actors, and spheres of power.

For instance, some users contended that Jewish interests exerted overwhelming control over the United States via the Zionist Lobby, aligning with the Protocols' objectives. Users evoked a Jewish conspiracy to undermine the Biden Administration, weaken the United States, and trigger a global war with China. One user wrote: "America is led by the Zionist lobby, in harmony with 'The Protocols of the Elders of Zion' that emerged at the first Jewish Congress held in Basel in Switzerland in 1897. [The Congress'] first decisions were that The Jews should rule the world in 100 Years... and in fact they have caused the two world wars."

A second prominent theme suggested a deliberate strategy to subjugate the Arab and Muslim worlds, aligning with the objectives outlined in the Protocols. Proponents of this narrative claimed that the text of the Protocols provided a framework for the systematic weakening of Arab and Muslim societies to pave the way for the territorial expansion of the State of Israel. Historical events such as the dissolution of the Ottoman Caliphate and the subsequent establishment of Israel are cited as evidence of this agenda.

A particular focus within this theme was the alleged targeting of strategic Arab nations to dismantle regional resistance against Israel's expansionist ambitions. For example, some users asserted that efforts to destabilize and isolate Egypt were part of a broader strategy, given Egypt's historical and geopolitical significance as a counterbalance to Israeli influence in the region. It was suggested that undermining Egypt could initiate a domino effect, making other Arab nations more vulnerable to manipulation and control.

This narrative also extends to the Gulf region, which is seen by some as a primary target for the strategies outlined in the Protocols. The recent peace agreements between Israel and several Arab states are alluded to by some as an outcome of the alleged Jewish master plan, aiming to integrate Israel into the Middle East while simultaneously undermining pan-Arab solidarity or Islamic unity and taking control over Palestinian territory.

For example, one user, identifying as an Egyptian patriot, emphasized in his bio that "the Egyptian family and the Egyptian army are red lines not to be crossed." He tweeted: "If we review the Protocols of the Elders of Zion we will conclude the following […] they [the Zionists] understand that if Egypt stabilizes and grows, it will dominate the world as it did before. They do not care about the Arab countries, but they do care about Egypt – because it is the obstacle to Israel's expansion. They began to demolish neighboring countries, which serve [to increase Egypt's] national security, weakening them."

A third, connected, narrative focused on the alleged Jewish strategy to undermine and dismantle global, but especially Arab and Muslim, societies. According to this narrative, the Protocols served as a blueprint for the propagation of corrupting morals and values, which are seen as antithetical to traditional Arab and Muslim cultures. This includes the promotion of concepts such as homosexuality, feminism, prostitution, and controversially, democracy itself. Those were presented as tools used to degrade societal norms, disrupt the concept of the family unit and ultimately dismantle the cultural and religious fabric of society. This narrative encompassed

the promotion of seemingly benign or trivial interests, such as sports, which were framed as tactics to divert attention from more substantive issues and concerns.

For example, one user tweeted: "In America, 40% of children are born out of wedlock. 20% of America's children live without a father at home, [only] with strong, independent single mothers. This is a product of feminism, which has begun to distort our Muslim societies as well. Anyone who has read 'the Protocols of the Elders of Zion' will know that this is something planned, not random."

A fourth narrative explored the assertion that the Protocols are employed as a strategic tool to discredit and undermine various political forces within the Arab world, including Arab regimes, the Muslim Brotherhood, and Iran. Users suggested that the Muslim Brotherhood's organizational structure and methods were purportedly influenced by the Protocols, alongside directives from Iran, with the alleged goal of inciting instability across Arab nations to foster chaos.

Additionally, some users claimed that Shiite countries, and particularly Iran, were orchestrating global dominance in collusion with Israel and the United States, as supposedly foretold in the Protocols and the Torah. This reflects a complex conspiracy involving unlikely alliances aimed at controlling the world stage. Another facet of this theme revolves around the legitimacy of Arab regimes, which are accused of betraying their populations.

For example, one user tweeted: "The corrupt Brotherhood is considered to be in its strongest form today, although it is in the interest of this malicious organization to claim that they are weakened or finished. Their jurisprudence [*fiqh*] is based on the Protocols of the Elders of Zion and the teachings of the Ayatollahs of Qom and the Imams of Tehran."

Although not all users disclosed their professions or nationalities, there are mentions of some being based in Egypt or Saudi Arabia. Typically, their X bios contained general aphorisms or sayings rather than explicit political or ideological stances. As opposed to users tweeting under the keywords Globalisten or holohoax, those who used Brutukalat were less outspoken about politics. This may be because of lesser political freedom in some Arabic countries, as compared to the German or Anglophone Worlds, or it may have cultural reasons.

Instead, users used the bio section to provide actual biographical data. Some filled their bios with Islamic religious content. According to the bios, the users tweeting under the keyword Brutukalat, are journalists, professors and businessmen. Among them were allegedly the accounts of the Hizbullah-affiliated al-Mayadeen news network, a former Kuwaiti government adviser, and the ex-spokesman of the Egyptian Freedom and Justice party.

Some examples of tweets and bios from the Brutukalat realm follow:

#### Tweets

1. #destructive. What is happening now in terms of grooming, nudity, and the international legalization of homosexuality and sodomy. The social media race to spread it is what the Zionist Jews and Freemasons sought in the past. To uncover the conspiracy, see the book

The Protocols of the Elders of Zion, the book The New World Order in 1990 AD, and others. Former US President Franklin warned of the danger of the Jews.

- 2. D From the Protocols of the Elders of Zion (inciting religious and racial differences, their effort to get rid of patriots and intellectuals, their effort to control the media and mislead public opinion, their effort to incite hostility between neighboring countries.
- 3. When the Jews come to power, wars break out and strife occurs everywhere in the world. Whoever reads the Protocols of the Elders of Zion knows what the Jews are doing in the world.

#### Bios

- 1. Al-Mayadeen Media Network is an Arab network, based on the slogan "reality as it is" and is committed to it, to convey the truth, news and opinion.
- 2. I dream of an Islam that walks on earth, not on Facebook pages and tweets in the skies of my country, not above the Twitter trees. I dream of you offering advice with taste, seeking justice, and belonging to the truth wherever it may be.
- 3. A Kuwaiti lawyer, graduated from the Military College in 1980 and obtained a Bachelor of Laws and Sharia in 1982. Worked as a defense officer and advisor to the Minister of Defense and a member of Parliament in 2008, an author, and a former prisoner of conscience.

The October 7 Hamas attack and Israel's subsequent military response had a strong impact on the Twitter/X debate surrounding the Protocols of the Elders of Zion. Following the attacks, the most prominent keywords used in the discussion revolved around the escalating conflict. Some keywords were connected to Saudi Arabia, befitting the prominent role of users from that country in the debate.

# - Dr. Fabian Spengler, with contribution from Morr Link